

## ELECTRONIC GOVERNMENT IN CLOSED CIRCUIT TELEVISION (CCTV) BASED SECURITY SYSTEMS IN MAKASSAR CITY

**Yunira Syailalhikma<sup>1\*</sup>, Muhammad Tahir Haning<sup>2</sup>, Muhammad Tang Abdullah<sup>3</sup>**

<sup>1</sup>Department of Public Administration, Hasanuddin University, Indonesia.

<sup>2</sup>Department of Social Welfare, Padjadjaran University, Indonesia.

<sup>3</sup>Public Administration Study Program, Hasanuddin University, Indonesia.

**\*CORRESPONDING AUTHOR: Yunira Syailalhikma**

<sup>\*</sup>Department of Public Administration, Hasanuddin University, Indonesia.

### Abstract

This research was conducted in Makassar City. The number of people with vehicles in Makassar City as well as staff employees or CCTV operators who work in 3 (agencies), namely the Communication and Information Service, the Transportation Service and the Makassar Big City Resort Police are very large, but due to the efficiency of time and energy, the author took The sample used non-probability sampling with an accidental sampling technique for people with the number of vehicles in Makassar City and with a purposive sampling technique for employee staff and CCTV operators from the three agencies so that 139 respondents were obtained, where the author then distributed questionnaires to respondents directly. This research uses the approach proposed by Nour et al (2008) who proposed an e-government initiative framework. The research results state that informational disposition includes aspects of access to government information and the research results show that the percentage of access to government information is 82.2%. Transactional disposition includes aspects of democratic responsiveness, integrity, public accountability and transparency. And the research results show that the percentage of the democratic responsiveness aspect is 79%, the integrity aspect is 82.3%, the public accountability aspect is 83.5% and the transparency aspect is 79.3%. Consultation disposition includes aspects of service availability, efficiency/economy, effectiveness/service quality and integrity. The results show that the percentage of service availability aspects is 80.7%, efficiency/economic aspects are 80.9%, service effectiveness/quality aspects are 80% and integrity aspects are 82.3%. Participatory disposition includes aspects of equity, democratic responsiveness, public accountability, efficiency/economy and effectiveness/quality of service. The research results show that the percentage of equity aspects is 84.7%, democratic responsiveness aspects are 79%, public accountability aspects are 83.5%, efficiency/economic aspects are 80.9% and effectiveness/service quality aspects are 80%. shows that respondents strongly agree that there is equity and agree that there is democratic responsiveness, public accountability, efficiency / economy and effectiveness / quality of service in the closed-circuit television (CCTV) based security system in Makassar City.

**Keywords:** Electronic Government, Security, Closed circuit Television

### Introduction

The importance of developing e-government in public administration can provide benefits, especially for public services, including the following: (a) Better services to the community. Information provided without must waiting for the office to open. Information can be searched from the office, home, without having to deliberately come to a government office as long as there is an internet network; (b) Improved relations between government, business actors and civil society. It is hoped that openness can change relations between various parties for the better, because this openness is expected to eliminate suspicion and resentment from all parties towards the government; (c) Community empowerment through easily obtained information; (d) Government implementation is more efficient; and (e) For the government, producing important letters and documents will be easier and faster. Government implementation becomes more efficient and tracking a person's data/information can be carried out more easily (Muliawaty & Hendryawan, 2020).

Looking at the security problems that exist in Makassar City, researchers see that the condition of Makassar City is unsafe and disturbing the local community. And the following is the total number of crimes or criminal acts that occurred in Makassar City from 2020 to 2022 which can be seen in the table below.

**Table 1.1 Number of Crimes in Makassar City 2020-2022**

Year	Number of Crimes
2020	2,435
2021	3,980
2022	9,501

Source: Makassar City Police 2022

Meanwhile, South Sulawesi Province, whose capital is Makassar City, is also one of the regions with the highest crime rate in Indonesia based on the 2020 Central Statistics Agency, which can be seen in the following table.

**Table 1.2 10 Regions with the Highest Crime in Indonesia 2018-2020**

Area	Crime Rates 2018-2020
North Sumatra	32,990
Metro Jaya	26,585
East Java	17,642
South Sulawesi	12,815
South Sumatra	12,189

West Java	11,256
Central Java	10,712
West Nusa Tenggara	8,591
Riau	8,194
West Sumatra	7,992

Source: Central Statistics Agency, 2020

The table shows that there are 10 regions with the highest crime rates in Indonesia, which places North Sumatra Province in first place with the highest provinces and South Sulawesi Province in the fourth highest province in Indonesia, with a crime rate of North Sumatra of 32,990, Metro Jaya of 26,585, Java East was 17,642, South Sulawesi was 12,815, South Sumatra was 12,189, West Java was 11,256, Central Java was 10,712, West Nusa Tenggara was 8,591, Riau was 8,194 and West Sumatra was 7,992.

The purpose and use of CCTV installed at several strategic points is to be able to monitor the situation and conditions in certain places, so that the government can minimize and prevent criminal acts or, more precisely, can be used as evidence of crimes that have occurred. The legal umbrella for the form of collaboration carried out by the government, the private sector and the community in implementing a digital CCTV technology-based security system is based on Makassar Mayor Regulation Number 4 of 2017 concerning the Provision and Installation of Closed Circuit Television (CCTV) in Buildings and Buildings which are reference from Law Number 19 of 2016 concerning Amendments to Law Number 11 of 2008 Regulating Information and Electronic Transactions.

Then, the installation of CCTV in Makassar City is only available at a few points, and this cannot support discipline, considering that Makassar City is congested and there are many more vulnerable and sensitive locations that should be installed with CCTV. The following is the number of CCTV camera installation points installed in Makassar City based on the type of CCTV program.

**Table 1.3 Number of CCTV Points in Makassar City Based on CCTV Type**

CCTV name	Number of Points
CCTV Smart & Somber' City Makassar City Communication and Information Service	230 points
ITCS CCTV	15 points

Makassar City Transportation Department	
ETLE CCTV	20 points
Makassar Big City Resort Police	

Source: Data Processed Results, 2023

Another problem with the CCTV security system in Makassar City is also due to differences of opinion between the alley council and the community council regarding the installation of CCTV so that the Makassar City Communications and Information Service is still holding back the installation of CCTV.

### Literature Review

In general, e-government initiatives embrace political values as well as values related to efficiency. The latter is arguably common to all initiatives, such as resource scarcity, overall probability, common denominators across all countries and government systems. For example, efficiency in government is an important value whether a government is democratic or not and whether a country is rich or poor. The political goals of e-government initiatives are a function of the government's level of democratization. The question of which subset among those objectives to include in a particular e-government initiative depends on the level of e-government readiness.

Thus, the proposed framework is based on differences in common efficiency-related values among e-government initiatives while the political objectives of e-government initiatives depend on two main dimensions: democratization and e-government readiness. One would expect that countries high in democratization would likely pay more attention to political values in their e-government initiatives than those low in democratization. In the same way, countries with high e-government readiness have a greater level of capacity readiness to achieve political values and values related to efficiency compared to those with low e-government readiness.

Thus, a more rational approach to setting the political objectives of an Initiative for e-government needs to consider the levels of both of these dimensions. Assuming two levels (high and low) for each dimension, four possible combinations are visible and can be represented by four quadrants in two-dimensional space.

From this explanation, Nour et al (2008) put forward an e-government initiative framework which can be seen in the following picture.

**Figure 2.1 E-Government Initiative Framework**Nour, et al (2008)



*Source: Nour, et al (2008)*

In the picture above, it can be seen that the e-government initiative framework proposed by Nour, et.al (2008) shows that there are four quadrants which are the benchmarks for concluding four types of dispositions in e-government. These four dispositions will be explained as follows.

### 1. Informational Disposition

This disposition is shown by the first quadrant which is depicted by the low level of democratization and e-government readiness. The main and realistically achievable goal of e-government here is to provide ready and efficient access to government information (information efficiency). Countries in this quadrant (e.g., Sub-Saharan African countries) tend to be characterized by extreme resource scarcity that dictates a primary focus on efficiency. Political goals (e.g., democratic responsiveness, public accountability, transparency, etc.) are actually a luxury for countries in this quadrant. The main concern here is that e-government can be used as an instrument of control and manipulation.

### 2. Transactional Disposition

This disposition results from the second quadrant which is represented by high e-government readiness and low levels of democratization. There are three values that tend to be dominant in this quadrant: transactional efficiency, effectiveness/quality of service, and integrity in the delivery of public services. In contrast to countries in the first quadrant, countries in this quadrant (for example, Malaysia and Singapore) strive to provide not only efficient access to information but also efficient and effective delivery of public services and integrity in the provision of those services. Here the focus is on efficiency, effectiveness and integrity in the delivery of public services.

### 3. Consultation Disposition

The third quadrant represents a combination of a high level of democratization and a low level of e-government readiness indicating a consultative disposition. The political values of e-

government are more likely to be paramount, although the limited e-government infrastructure here poses real obstacles to the realization of these values. Nonetheless, democratic values (e.g. transparency and integrity) that do not require policy dialogue between government and citizens can still be achieved in this context.

#### 4. Participative Disposition

The fourth quadrant is high on the democratization and e-government readiness index, indicating a participative disposition. What distinguishes this quadrant from the previous three quadrants is that it represents the setting in which the realization of all objectives (both political and efficiency related) of e-government can be carried out. Although political goals are paramount here, efficiency-related goals are also important, especially in the context of prolonged economic stagnation and chronic fiscal deficits.

#### Research methods

In research on electronic government in closed circuit television (CCTV) based security systems in Makassar City, a quantitative approach is used because in this research the analysis focuses more on numerical data (numbers) which are processed using statistical methods to analyze how electronic government works in security systems. based on closed circuit television (CCTV) in Makassar City. This research was carried out in Makassar City, including the authorities who run Closed Circuit Television (CCTV) Based Security Systems, in this case the Makassar City Communication and Information Service as the leading sector in closed circuit television (CCTV) based security systems. Data sources are Primary Data and Secondary Data. Data collection techniques were carried out using questionnaires and document review.

The population and samples were the Makassar City Transportation Service as many as 27 people and the Makassar City Police Department as many as 11 people. So the total number of employees or CCTV operators from these three agencies is 63 people. The number of samples in this study was calculated using the Slovin formula, namely:

n = Number of Samples

N = Total Population

1,960,211 (Number of Vehicles in Makassar City)

63 (CCTV Operator Staff)

e = Error Rate: 10%

$$n = \frac{N}{1 + (N \times e^2)} \quad n = \frac{1.960.211}{1 + (1.960.211 \times 0,1^2)}$$

$$n = \frac{1.960.211}{1 + (19.602,11)}$$

$$n = \frac{1.960.211}{19.603,11} = 99,99$$

rounded to 100

$$n = \frac{N}{1 + (N \times e^2)}$$

$$n = \frac{63}{1 + (63 \times 0,1^2)}$$

$$n = \frac{63}{1 + (0,63)}$$

$$n = \frac{63}{1,63}$$

$$n = 38.65$$

Rounded up to 39 So the number of samples in the electronic government research on closed circuit television (CCTV)-based security systems in Makassar City was 139 respondents, namely people with CCTV operator staff.

## 1. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Based on the research problem formulation regarding Electronic Government in Closed Circuit Television (CCTV) Based Security Systems in Makassar City, this study focuses on closed circuit television (CCTV) based security systems implemented in Makassar City. In analyzing electronic government in closed circuit television (CCTV) based security systems in Makassar City, the e-government initiative framework was used by Nour, et al (2008) with 4 (four) e-government dispositions, namely informational disposition, transactional disposition, disposition consultation and participatory disposition as will be explained below.

### *Informational Disposition*

The informational disposition is shown in the first quadrant which emphasizes aspects of access to government information as explained below.

#### *1. Access to Government Information*

In measuring the first disposition, namely informational disposition, it can be seen from the aspect of access to government information.

The aspect of access to government information in a closed circuit television (CCTV)-based security system can be seen by how the government provides access to CCTV information to the public and the government can provide and communicate CCTV information clearly and completely to the public.

Below is a recapitulation of the values and range of values for aspects of access to government information, as follows.

**Table 5.3 The Value of Access to Government Information**

No.	Respondent's Answer		Strongly Disagree	Don't agree	Disagree	Agree	Strongly agree	Amount
			1	2	3	4	5	
1	The government	F	1	2	15	87	34	139

	provides access to Makassar City CCTV information to the public	% f x	(0.7%) 1	(0.43%) 4	(10.7%) 45	(64.1%) 348	(24%) 170	(100%) 568
2	The government can provide and provide clear and complete CCTV information to the public	F % f x	1 (0.7%) 1	1 (0.7%) 2	10 (7%) 30	93 (67.6%) 372	34 (24%) 170	139 (100%) 575
<b>Total</b>		<b>Number of Respondents (f)</b>						139
		<b>Total Percentage (%)</b>						82.2 %
		<b>Number of fx</b>						1143

Source: Data Processed Results, 2023

From this table it can be explained that of the 139 respondents who were given the questionnaire, the value of the access to government information aspect was 1143 or 82.2%. The following will explain the range of values for aspects of access to government information, namely as follows:

**Table 5.4 Range of Values for Access to Government Information**

Value Range	Category
278 – 500	Strongly Disagree
501 – 723	Don't agree
724 – 946	Disagree
947 – 1169	Agree
1170 - 1392	Strongly agree

Source: Data Processed Results, 2023



The total value for the access to government information aspect is 1143 or 82.2% of the maximum percentage for this indicator. From these values it can be concluded that respondents agree that there is an aspect of access to government information in the closed circuit television (CCTV) based security system in Makassar City.

### *Transactional Disposition*

The transactional disposition is shown in the second quadrant which emphasizes several aspects, including: democratic responsiveness, integrity, public accountability and transparency as explained below.

#### *1. Democratic Responsiveness*

In measuring the second disposition, namely transactional disposition, it can be seen using the aspect of democratic responsiveness.

The aspect of democratic responsiveness in a closed circuit television (CCTV) based security system can be seen in how the government has served the public and parties who need CCTV information quickly and the government has served to provide CCTV information accurately and easily.

Below is a recapitulation of the values and range of values for aspects of access to government information, as follows.

**Table 5.5 The Value of Democratic Responsiveness**

No.	Respondent's Answer		Strongly Disagree	Don't agree	Disagree	Agree	Strongly agree	Amount
			1	2	3	4	5	
1	The government has served the public and parties who need CCTV information quickly	F	1	2	33	71	32	139
		%	(0.7%)	(0.43%)	(23.7%)	(51.9%)	(23%)	
2	The government has served to provide	F	4	2	23	77	33	139
		%	(2.8%)	(0.43%)	(16.5%)	(56.5%)	(23.7%)	
		fx	1	4	99	284	160	548
			4		69		165	550

	CCTV information accurately and easily	f	x	4		308		
<b>Total</b>	<b>Number of Respondents (f)</b>							139
	<b>Total Percentage (%)</b>							79 %
	<b>Number of fx</b>							1098

Source: Data Processed Results, 2023

From this table it can be explained that of the 139 respondents who were given the questionnaire, the value of the democratic responsiveness aspect was 1098 or 79%. The following will explain the range of values for aspects of democratic responsiveness, namely as follows:

**Table 5.6 Range of Democratic Responsiveness Values**

Value Range	Category
278 – 500	Strongly Disagree
501 – 723	Don't agree
724 – 946	Disagree
947 – 1169	Agree
1170 - 1392	Strongly agree

Source: Data Processed Results, 2023

The total value of democratic responsiveness is 1098 or 79% of the maximum percentage for this indicator. From these values it can be concluded that respondents agree that there is an aspect of democratic responsiveness in the closed circuit television (CCTV) based security system in Makassar City.

## **2. Integrity**

In measuring the second disposition, namely transactional disposition, one of them can be seen with the integrity aspect.

The integrity aspect in a closed circuit television (CCTV)-based security system can be seen by how the government has adhered to the rules in implementing a CCTV-based security system, has worked in accordance with the actual situation, neither added nor subtracted from the facts in the implementation of a CCTV-based security system.. Below is a recapitulation of the values and range of values for the integrity aspect, as follows.

**Table 5.7 Integrity Value**

No.	Respondent's Answer		Strongly Disagree	Don't agree	Disagree	Agree	Strongly agree	Amount
			1	2	3	4	5	
1	The government has complied with the rules in implementing a CCTV-based security system in Makassar City	F	0	1	14	91	33	139
		%	(0%)	(0.7%)	(10%)	(65.6%)	(23.7%)	(100%)
		fx	0	2	42	364	165	573
2	The government has worked according to the actual situation, neither adding nor subtracting facts in the implementation of the CCTV-based security system in Makassar City	F	1	0	4	98	36	139
		%	(0.7%)	(0%)	(2.8%)	(70.7%)	(25.8%)	(100%)
		fx	1	0	12	392	180	585
3	The government shows consistent enthusiasm to always work on implementing a CCTV-based security system in Makassar City	F	0	2	29	75	33	139
		%	(0%)	(0.43%)	(20.8%)	(55.07%)	(23.7%)	(100%)
		fx	0	4	87	300	165	556
4	The government has and shows commitment to implementing a CCTV-based	F	1	1	18	76	43	139
		%	(0.7%)	(0.7%)	(12.9%)	(54.8%)	(30.9%)	(100%)
		fx	1	2	54	304	215	576

	security system in Makassar City							
<b>Total</b>		<b>Number of Respondents (f)</b>						139
		<b>Total Percentage (%)</b>						82.3 %
		<b>Number of fx</b>						2290

Source: Data Processed Results, 2023

From this table it can be explained that of the 139 respondents who were given the questionnaire, the integrity aspect score was 2290 or 82.3%. The following will explain the range of integrity aspect values, namely as follows.

**Table 5.8 Integrity Value Range**

Value Range	Category
556 – 1001	Strongly Disagree
1002 – 1447	Don't agree
1448 – 1893	Disagree
1894 – 2339	Agree
2340 - 2785	Strongly agree

Source: Data Processed Results, 2023

The total value for the integrity aspect is 2290 or 82.3% of the maximum percentage for this indicator. From these values it can be concluded that respondents agree that there is an integrity aspect in the closed circuit television (CCTV) based security system in Makassar City.

### **3. Public Accountability**

In measuring the second disposition, namely transactional disposition, one of them can be seen through the aspect of public accountability.

The aspect of public accountability in a closed circuit television (CCTV) based security system can be seen in how the government has responsible for what has been provided to the public and parties who need CCTV information and the government has carried out its duties well in providing CCTV information to the public.

Below is a recapitulation of the values and range of values for the public accountability aspect, as follows.

**Table 5.9 The Value of Public Accountability**

No.	Respondent's Answer		Strongly Disagree	Don't agree	Disagree	Agree	Strongly agree	Amount
			1	2	3	4	5	
1	The government is responsible for what has been provided to the public and parties who need CCTV information	F	1	0	13	97	28	139
		%	(0.7%)	(0%)	(9.3%)	(69.9%)	(20.1%)	(100%)
		fx	1	0	39	388	140	586
2	The government has carried out its duties well in providing CCTV information to the public	F	1	0	13	89	36	139
		%	(0.7%)	(0%)	(9.3%)	(64.2%)	(25.8%)	(100%)
		fx	1	0	39	356	180	576
<b>Total</b>		<b>Number of Respondents (f)</b>						139
		<b>Total Percentage (%)</b>						83.5 %
		<b>Number of fx</b>						1162

Source: Data Processed Results, 2023

From this table it can be explained that of the 139 respondents who were given the questionnaire, the value of the public accountability aspect was 1162 or 83.5%. The following will explain the range of values for aspects of public accountability, namely as follows:

**Table 5.10 Range of Public Accountability Values**

Value Range	Category
278 – 500	Strongly Disagree
501 – 723	Don't agree
724 – 946	Disagree
947 – 1169	Agree
1170 - 1392	Strongly agree

Source: Data Processed Results, 2023

The total value for the public accountability aspect is 1162 or 83.5% of the maximum percentage for this indicator. From these values it can be concluded that respondents agree that there is an aspect of public accountability in the closed circuit television (CCTV) based security system in Makassar City.

#### 4. Transparency

To measure the second disposition, namely transactional disposition, one of them can be seen through the transparency aspect.

The transparency aspect in a closed circuit television (CCTV) based security system can be seen in how the government has provided information CCTV that is clear and open to the public and the Government does not cover up CCTV information about procedures, costs and responsibilities to the public and those in need.

Below is a recapitulation of the values and range of values for the transparency aspect, as follows.

**Table 5.11 Transparency Value**

No.	Respondent's Answer		Strongly Disagree	Don't agree	Disagree	Agree	Strongly agree	Amount
			1	2	3	4	5	
1	The government has provided CCTV information that is clear and open to the public	F	2	3	21	86	27	139
		%	(0.43%)	(2.1%)	(15.1%)	(62.9%)	(19.4%)	(100%)
		fx	2	6	63	344	135	550
2	The government does not cover up CCTV information about procedures, costs and responsibilities to the community and those in need	F	2	2	17	94	24	139
		%	(0.43%)	(0.43%)	(12.2%)	(69.7%)	(17.2%)	(100%)
		fx	2	4	51	376	120	553
<b>Total</b>			<b>Number of Respondents (f)</b>					139
			<b>Total Percentage (%)</b>					79.3 %
			<b>Number of fx</b>					1103

Source: Data Processed Results, 2023

From this table it can be explained that of the 139 respondents who were given the questionnaire, the value of the transparency aspect was 1103 or 79.3%. The following will explain the range of values for the transparency aspect, namely as follows.

**Table 5.12 Transparency Value Range**

Value Range	Category
278 – 500	Strongly Disagree
501 – 723	Don't agree
724 – 946	Disagree
947 – 1169	Agree
1170 - 1392	Strongly agree

Source: Data Processed Results, 2023

The total value for the transparency aspect is 1103 or 79.3% of the maximum percentage for this indicator. From these values it can be concluded that respondents agree that there is an aspect of transparency in the closed circuit television (CCTV) based security system in Makassar City.

***Consultation Disposition***

The consultation position is shown in the third quadrant which emphasizes several aspects, including: service availability, efficiency/economy, effectiveness/quality of service and integrity as explained below.

***1. Service Availability***

In measuring the third disposition, namely consultation disposition, one of them can be seen from the aspect of service availability.

The aspect of service availability in a closed circuit television (CCTV) based security system can be seen by how CCTV information can be provided by the public and parties who need it by the government when needed and the steps or procedures in obtaining CCTV information are carried out easily by the public and parties who need it.

Below is a recapitulation of the values and range of values for the service availability aspect, as follows.

**Table 5.13 Service Availability Value**

No.	Respondent's Answer	Strongly Disagree	Don't agree	Disagree	Agree	Strongly agree	Amount
		1	2	3	4	5	

1	CCTV information can be provided by the public and parties who need it by the government when needed	F	0	2	25	77	35	139
		%	(0%)	(0.43%)	(17.9%)	(56.5%)	(25.1%)	(100%)
		fx	0	4	75	308	175	562
2	The steps or procedures for obtaining CCTV information can be carried out easily by the public and parties who need it	F	1	3	20	81	34	139
		%	(0.7%)	(2.1%)	(14.3%)	(58.5%)	(24.4%)	(100%)
		fx	1	6	60	324	170	561
<b>Total</b>	<b>Number of Respondents (f)</b>							100
	<b>Total Percentage (%)</b>							80.7 %
	<b>Number of fx</b>							1123

Source: Data Processed Results, 2023

From this table it can be explained that of the 139 respondents who were given the questionnaire, the value of the service availability aspect was 1123 or 80.7%. The following will explain the range of values for the service availability aspect, namely as follows:

**Table 5.14 Service Availability Value Range**

Value Range	Category
278 – 500	Strongly Disagree
501 – 723	Don't agree
724 – 946	Disagree
947 – 1169	Agree
1170 - 1392	Strongly agree

Source: Data Processed Results, 2023

The total value for the service availability aspect is 1123 or 80.7% of the maximum percentage for this indicator. From these values it can be concluded that respondents agree that there is an



aspect of service availability in the closed circuit television (CCTV) based security system in Makassar City.

## 2. Efficiency / Economy

In measuring the third disposition, namely the consultation disposition, one of them can be seen from the efficiency/economic aspect.

The efficiency/economic aspect of a closed circuit television (CCTV) based security system can be seen by how the government uses existing resources in implementing the Makassar City CCTV security system and the government is able to quickly carry out activities in implementing the Makassar City CCTV security system.

Below is a recapitulation of the values and range of values for the efficiency/economic aspects, as follows.

**Table 5.15 Efficiency / Economic Value**

No.	Respondent's Answer		Strongly Disagree	Don't agree	Disagree	Agree	Strongly agree	Amount
			1	2	3	4	5	
1	The government uses existing resources in implementing the Makassar City CCTV security system	F	1	0	25	81	32	139
		%	(0.7%)	(0%)	(17.9%)	(58.4%)	(23%)	(100%)
		fx	1	0	75	324	160	560
2	The government was able to quickly carry out activities in implementing the Makassar City CCTV security system	F	2	1	24	71	41	139
		%	(0.43%)	(0.7%)	(17.2%)	(52.2%)	(29.4%)	(100%)
		fx	2	2	72	284	205	565
<b>Total</b>			<b>Number of Respondents (f)</b>					139
			<b>Total Percentage (%)</b>					80.9 %
			<b>Number of fx</b>					1125

Source: Data Processed Results, 2023

From this table it can be explained that of the 139 respondents who were given the questionnaire, the value of the efficiency/economic aspect was 1125 or 80.9%. The following will explain the range of values for the efficiency/economic aspects, namely as follows:

**Table 5.16 Efficiency / Economic Value Range**

Value Range	Category
278 – 500	Strongly Disagree
501 – 723	Don't agree
724 – 946	Disagree
947 – 1169	Agree
1170 - 1392	Strongly agree

Source: Data Processed Results, 2023

The total value for the efficiency/economic aspect is 1125 or 80.9% of the maximum percentage for this indicator. From these values it can be concluded that respondents agree that there are efficiency/economic aspects in the closed circuit television (CCTV) based security system in Makassar City.

### **3. Effectiveness / Quality of Service**

Measuring the third disposition, namely consultation disposition, can be seen from the effectiveness/quality of service aspect.

The aspect of effectiveness/quality of service in a closed circuit television (CCTV) based security system can be seen by how the government has provided CCTV information services that are fast, easy and friendly to people who need them; the government has carried out activities to implement a CCTV-based security system for Makassar City in accordance with procedures and in accordance with community needs; the quality of CCTV information (visual / CCTV display) provided to the public and parties who need it is good and clearly visible; the condition of the equipment and supplies in the Makassar City CCTV security system is adequate and can be used properly; Makassar City CCTV security system services respond appropriately to community problems/needs; the response of the government / CCTV security system officers to the public is carried out well if there is a security problem that occurs; as well as Makassar City CCTV security system services (government and authorized officers) provide good attention to the community.

Below is a recapitulation of the values and range of values for the effectiveness/quality of service aspect, which are as follows.

**Table 5.17 Value of Effectiveness / Service Quality**

No.	Respondent's Answer		Strongly Disagree	Don't agree	Disagree	Agree	Strongly agree	Amount
			1	2	3	4	5	
1	The government has provided fast CCTV information services to the public and parties who need it	F	0	0	24	79	36	139
		%	(0%)	(0%)	(17.2%)	(57%)	(25.8%)	(100%)
		fx	0	0	72	316	180	568
2	The government has provided easy CCTV information services to the public and parties who need it	F	2	0	26	75	36	139
		%	(0.43%)	(0%)	(18.7%)	(55%)	(25.8%)	(100%)
		fx	2	0	78	300	180	560
3	The government has provided CCTV information services in a friendly manner to the public and those in need	F	0	0	33	71	35	139
		%	(0%)	(0%)	(23.7%)	(51.2%)	(25.1%)	(%)
		fx	0	0	99	284	175	558
4	The quality of CCTV information (visual / CCTV display) provided to the public and parties who need it is good and clearly visible	F	0	4	32	68	35	139
		%	(%)	(2.8%)	(23%)	(49.1%)	(25.1%)	(100%)
		fx	0	8	96	272	175	551
5	The government has carried out activities to implement the Makassar City CCTV-based security system in	F	1	1	15	83	39	139
		%	(0.7%)	(0.7%)	(10.7%)	(59.9%)	(28%)	(100%)
		fx	1	2	45	332	195	575

	accordance with procedures							
6	The government has carried out activities to implement a CCTV-based security system for Makassar City in accordance with community needs	F	0	0	24	78	37	139
		%	(0%)	(0%)	(17.2%)	(56.2%)	(26.6%)	(100%)
		fx	0	0	72	312	185	569
7	The condition of the equipment and supplies in the Makassar City CCTV security system is good and proper and can be used properly	F	0	1	35	87	16	139
		%	(0%)	(0.7%)	(25.1%)	(62.7%)	(11.5%)	(100%)
		fx	0	2	105	348	80	535
8	Makassar City CCTV security system services respond to community problems/needs appropriately	F	0	1	25	97	16	139
		%	(0%)	(0.7%)	(17.9%)	(69.9%)	(11.5%)	(100%)
		fx	0	2	75	388	80	545
9	The response of the government/CCTV security system officials to the public is carried out well if there are security problems that occur	F	0	1	19	102	17	139
		%	(0%)	(0.7%)	(13.6%)	(73.5%)	(12.2%)	(100%)
		fx	0	2	57	408	85	552
10	Makassar City CCTV security system services (government and authorized	F	0	0	26	95	18	139
		%	(0%)	(0%)	(18.7%)	(68.4%)	(12.9%)	(100%)
		fx	0	0	78	380	90	548

	officers) provide good attention to the community							
<b>Total</b>	<b>Number of Respondents (f)</b>							139
	<b>Total Percentage (%)</b>							80 %
	<b>Number of fx</b>							5561

Source: Data Processed Results, 2023

From this table it can be explained that of the 139 respondents who were given the questionnaire, the value of the effectiveness/service quality aspect was 5561 or 80%. The following will explain the range of values for aspects of service effectiveness/quality, namely as follows:

**Table 5.18 Range of Service Effectiveness / Quality Values**

Value Range	Category
1390 – 2502	Strongly Disagree
2503 – 3615	Don't agree
3616 – 4728	Disagree
4729 – 5841	Agree
5842 - 6954	Strongly agree

Source: Data Processed Results, 2023

The total value for the effectiveness/quality of service aspect is 5561 or 80% of the maximum percentage for this indicator. From these values it can be concluded that respondents agree that there are aspects of effectiveness/service quality in the closed circuit television (CCTV) based security system in Makassar City.

#### **4. Integrity**

In measuring the third disposition, namely the consultation disposition, one of them can also be seen using the integrity aspect.

The integrity aspect in the closed circuit television (CCTV) based security system can be seen by how the government has adhered to the rules in implementing the CCTV based security system, has worked in accordance with the actual situation, neither added nor subtracted from the facts in the implementation of the CCTV based security system, showing Consistent enthusiasm to always work in implementing a CCTV-based security system and having and showing commitment to implementing a CCTV-based security system in Makassar City.

Below is a recapitulation of the values and range of values for the integrity aspect, as follows.

**Table 5.19 Integrity Value**

No.	Respondent's Answer		Strongly Disagree	Don't agree	Disagree	Agree	Strongly agree	Amount
			1	2	3	4	5	
1	The government has complied with the rules in implementing a CCTV-based security system in Makassar City	F	0	1	14	91	33	139
		%	(0%)	(0.7%)	(10%)	(65.6%)	(23.7%)	(100%)
		fx	0	2	42	364	165	573
2	The government has worked according to the actual situation, neither adding nor subtracting facts in the implementation of the CCTV-based security system in Makassar City	F	1	0	4	98	36	139
		%	(0.7%)	(0%)	(2.8%)	(70.7%)	(25.8%)	(100%)
		fx	1	0	12	392	180	585
3	The government shows consistent enthusiasm to always work on implementing a CCTV-based security system in Makassar City	F	0	2	29	75	33	139
		%	(0%)	(0.43%)	(20.8%)	(55.07%)	(23.7%)	(100%)
		fx	0	4	87	300	165	556
4	The government has and shows commitment to implementing a CCTV-based security system in Makassar City	F	1	1	18	76	43	139
		%	(0.7%)	(0.7%)	(12.9%)	(54.8%)	(30.9%)	(100%)
		fx	1	2	54	304	215	576

<b>Total</b>	<b>Number of Respondents (f)</b>	139
	<b>Total Percentage (%)</b>	82.3 %
	<b>Number of fx</b>	2290

Source: Data Processed Results, 2023

From this table it can be explained that of the 139 respondents who were given the questionnaire, the integrity aspect score was 2290 or 82.3%. The following will explain the range of integrity aspect values, namely as follows.

**Table 5.20 Integrity Value Range**

Value Range	Category
556 – 1001	Strongly Disagree
1002 – 1447	Don't agree
1448 – 1893	Disagree
1894 – 2339	Agree
2340 - 2785	Strongly agree

Source: Data Processed Results, 2023

The total value for the integrity aspect is 2290 or 82.3% of the maximum percentage for this indicator. From these values it can be concluded that respondents agree that there is an integrity aspect in the closed circuit television (CCTV) based security system in Makassar City.

### ***Participative Disposition***

The participatory disposition is shown in the fourth quadrant which emphasizes several aspects, including: equity, democratic responsiveness, public accountability, efficiency/economy and effectiveness/quality of service as explained below.

#### ***1. Equity***

To measure the fourth disposition, namely participative disposition, one of them can be seen as equity.

The equity aspect in a closed circuit television (CCTV)-based security system can be seen by how the CCTV-based security system in Makassar City is an asset that can increase the wealth of entities in the Makassar City Government.

Below is a recapitulation of the values and value ranges of the equity aspects, as follows.

**Table 5.21 Equity Value**

No.	Respondent's Answer		Strongly Disagree	Don't agree	Disagree	Agree	Strongly agree	Amount
			1	2	3	4	5	
1	The CCTV-based security system in Makassar City is an asset that can increase the wealth of entities in the Makassar City Government	F	0	3	14	69	53	139
		%	(0%)	(2.1%)	(10%)	(49.8%)	(38.1%)	(100%)
		fx	0	6	42	276	265	589
<b>Total</b>		<b>Number of Respondents (f)</b>						139
		<b>Total Percentage (%)</b>						84.7 %
		<b>Number of fx</b>						589

Source: Data Processed Results, 2023

From this table it can be explained that of the 139 respondents who were given the questionnaire, the value of the equity aspect was 589 or 84.7%. The following will explain the range of equity aspect values, namely as follows:

**Table 5.22 Equity Value Range**

Value Range	Category
139 – 250	Strongly Disagree
251 – 362	Don't agree
363 – 474	Disagree
475 – 586	Agree
587 - 698	Strongly agree

Source: Data Processed Results, 2023

The total value of the equity aspect is 589 or 84.7% of the maximum percentage for this indicator. From these values it can be concluded that respondents strongly agree that there is an equity aspect in the closed circuit television (CCTV) based security system in Makassar City.

## **2. Democratic Responsiveness**

In measuring the fourth disposition, namely participatory disposition, it can also be seen from the aspect of democratic responsiveness.



The aspect of democratic responsiveness in a closed circuit television (CCTV) based security system can be seen in how the government has served the public and parties who need CCTV information quickly and the government has served to provide CCTV information accurately and easily.

Below is a recapitulation of the values and range of values for aspects of access to government information, as follows.

**Table 5.23 The Value of Democratic Responsiveness**

No.	Respondent's Answer		Strongly Disagree	Don't agree	Disagree	Agree	Strongly agree	Amount
			1	2	3	4	5	
1	The government has served the public and parties who need CCTV information quickly	F	1	2	33	71	32	139
		%	(0.7%)	(0.43%)	(23.7%)	(51.9%)	(23%)	(100%)
		fx	1	4	99	284	160	548
2	The government has served to provide CCTV information accurately and easily	F	4	2	23	77	33	139
		%	(2.8%)	(0.43%)	(16.5%)	(56.5%)	(23.7%)	(100%)
		fx	4	4	69	308	165	550
<b>Total</b>	<b>Number of Respondents (f)</b>							139
	<b>Total Percentage (%)</b>							79 %
	<b>Number of fx</b>							1098

Source: Data Processed Results, 2023

From this table it can be explained that of the 139 respondents who were given the questionnaire, the value of the democratic responsiveness aspect was 1098 or 79%. The following will explain the range of values for aspects of democratic responsiveness, namely as follows:

**Table 5.24 Range of Democratic Responsiveness Values**

Value Range	Category
278 – 500	Strongly Disagree
501 – 723	Don't agree

724 – 946	Disagree
947 – 1169	Agree
1170 - 1392	Strongly agree

Source: Data Processed Results, 2023

The total value of democratic responsiveness is 1098 or 79% of the maximum percentage for this indicator. From these values it can be concluded that respondents agree that there is an aspect of democratic responsiveness in the closed circuit television (CCTV) based security system in Makassar City.

### 3. Public Accountability

In measuring the fourth disposition, namely participatory disposition, one of them can also be seen from the aspect of public accountability.

The aspect of public accountability in a closed circuit television (CCTV) based security system can be seen by how the government has been responsible for what has been provided to the public and parties who need CCTV information and the government has carried out its duties well in providing CCTV information to the public.

Below is a recapitulation of the values and range of values for the public accountability aspect, as follows.

**Table 5.25 The Value of Public Accountability**

No.	Respondent's Answer		Strongly Disagree	Don't agree	Disagree	Agree	Strongly agree	Amount
			1	2	3	4	5	
1	The government is responsible for what has been provided to the public and parties who need CCTV information	F	1	0	13 (9.3%)	97 (69.9%)	28 (20.1%)	139 (100%)
		%	(0.7%)	(0%)				
		fx	1	0	39	388	140	586
2	The government has carried out its duties well in providing CCTV information to the public	F	1	0	13 (9.3%)	89 (64.2%)	36 (25.8%)	139 (100%)
		%	(0.7%)	(0%)				
		fx	1	0	39	356	180	576
<b>Total</b>			<b>Number of Respondents (f)</b>					<b>139</b>

	<b>Total Percentage (%)</b>	83.5 %
	<b>Number of fx</b>	1162

Source: Data Processed Results, 2023

From this table it can be explained that of the 139 respondents who were given the questionnaire, the value of the public accountability aspect was 1162 or 83.5%. The following will explain the range of values for aspects of public accountability, namely as follows:

**Table 5.26 Range of Public Accountability Values**

Value Range	Category
278 – 500	Strongly Disagree
501 – 723	Don't agree
724 – 946	Disagree
947 – 1169	Agree
1170 - 1392	Strongly agree

Source: Data Processed Results, 2023

The total value for the public accountability aspect is 1162 or 83.5% of the maximum percentage for this indicator. From these values it can be concluded that respondents agree that there is an aspect of public accountability in closed circuit tele-based security systemsvision (CCTV) in Makassar City.

#### **4. Efficiency/Economy**

In measuring the fourth disposition, namely participatory disposition, one of them can also be seen from the efficiency/economic aspect.

The efficiency/economic aspect of a closed circuit television (CCTV) based security system can be seen by how the government uses existing resources in implementing the Makassar City CCTV security system and the government is able to quickly carry out activities in implementing the Makassar City CCTV security system.

Below is a recapitulation of the values and range of values for the efficiency/economic aspects, as follows.

**Table 5.27 Efficiency / Economic Value**

No.	Respondent's Answer		Strongly Disagree	Don't agree	Disagree	Agree	Strongly agree	Amount
			1	2	3	4	5	
1	The government uses existing	F	1	0	25	81	32	139

	resources in implementing the Makassar City CCTV security system	%	(0.7%)	(0%)	(17.9%)	(58.4%)	(23%)	(100%)
		fx	1	0	75	324	160	560
2	The government was able to quickly carry out activities in implementing the Makassar City CCTV security system	F	2	1	24	71	41	139
		%	(0.43%)	(0.7%)	(17.2%)	(52.2%)	(29.4%)	(100%)
		fx	2	2	72	284	205	565
<b>Total</b>	<b>Number of Respondents (f)</b>							139
	<b>Total Percentage (%)</b>							80.9 %
	<b>Number of fx</b>							1125

Source: Data Processed Results, 2023

From this table it can be explained that of the 139 respondents who were given the questionnaire, the value of the efficiency/economic aspect was 1125 or 80.9%. The following will explain the range of values for the efficiency/economic aspects, namely as follows:

**Table 5.28 Efficiency / Economic Value Range**

Value Range	Category
278 – 500	Strongly Disagree
501 – 723	Don't agree
724 – 946	Disagree
947 – 1169	Agree
1170 - 1392	Strongly agree

Source: Data Processed Results, 2023

The total value for the efficiency/economic aspect is 1125 or 80.9% of the maximum percentage for this indicator. From these values it can be concluded that respondents agree that there are efficiency/economic aspects in the closed circuit television (CCTV) based security system in Makassar City.

### 5. Effectiveness/Quality of Service

To measure the fourth disposition, namely participatory disposition, it can also be seen from the effectiveness/quality of service aspect.

The aspect of effectiveness/quality of service in a closed circuit television (CCTV) based security system can be seen by how the government has provided CCTV information services that are fast, easy and friendly to people who need them; the government has carried out activities to implement a CCTV-based security system for Makassar City in accordance with procedures and in accordance with community needs; the quality of CCTV information (visual / CCTV display) provided to the public and parties who need it is good and clearly visible; the condition of the equipment and supplies in the Makassar City CCTV security system is adequate and can be used properly; Makassar City CCTV security system services respond to problems/kebproper integration of society.

Below is a recapitulation of the values and range of values for the effectiveness/quality of service aspect, which are as follows.

**Table 5.29 Value of Effectiveness / Service Quality**

No	Respondent's Answer		Strongly Disagree	Don't agree	Disagree	Agree	Strongly agree	Amount
			1	2	3	4	5	
1	The government has provided fast CCTV information services to the public and parties who need it	F	0	0	24	79	36	139
		%	(0%)	(0%)	(17.2%)	(57%)	(25.8%)	
		fx	0	0	72	316	180	568
2	The government has provided easy CCTV information services to the public and parties who need it	F	2	0	26	75	36	139
		%	(0.43%)	(0%)	(18.7%)	(55%)	(25.8%)	
		fx	2	0	78	300	180	560
3	The government has provided CCTV information services in a friendly manner to the public and those in need	F	0	0	33	71	35	139
		%	(0%)	(0%)	(23.7%)	(51.2%)	(25.1%)	
		fx	0	0	99	284	175	558
4	The quality of CCTV information (visual /	F	0	4	32	68	35	139

	CCTV display) provided to the public and parties who need it is good and clearly visible	% fx	(%) 0	(2.8%) 8	(23%) 96	(49.1%) 272	(25.1%) 175	(100%) 551
5	The government has carried out activities to implement the Makassar City CCTV-based security system in accordance with procedures	F % fx	1 (0.7%) 1	1 (0.7%) 2	15 (10.7%) 45	83 (59.9%) 332	39 (28%) 195	139 (100%) 575
6	The government has carried out activities to implement a CCTV-based security system for Makassar City in accordance with community needs	F % fx	0 (0%) 0	0 (0%) 0	24 (17.2%) 72	78 (56.2%) 312	37 (26.6%) 185	139 (100%) 569
7	The condition of the equipment and supplies in the Makassar City CCTV security system is good and proper and can be used properly	F % fx	0 (0%) 0	1 (0.7%) 2	35 (25.1%) 105	87 (62.7%) 348	16 (11.5%) 80	139 (100%) 535
8	Makassar City CCTV security system services respond to community problems/needs appropriately	F % fx	0 (0%) 0	1 (0.7%) 2	25 (17.9%) 75	97 (69.9%) 388	16 (11.5%) 80	139 (100%) 545
9	The response of the government/CCTV security system officials to the public is carried out well if there are security problems that occur	F % fx	0 (0%) 0	1 (0.7%) 2	19 (13.6%) 57	102 (73.5%) 408	17 (12.2%) 85	139 (100%) 552
10	Makassar City CCTV security system services (government and	F % fx	0 (0%) 0	0 (0%) 0	26 (18.8%) 75	95 (69.1%) 272	18 (13.1%) 55	139 (100%) 382

	authorized officers) provide good attention to the community	fx	0	0	(18.7% ) 78	(68.4% ) 380	(12.9% ) 90	548
<b>Total</b>	<b>Number of Respondents (f)</b>							139
	<b>Total Percentage (%)</b>							80 %
	<b>Number of fx</b>							5561

Source: Data Processed Results, 2023

From this table it can be explained that of the 139 respondents who were given the questionnaire, the value of the effectiveness/service quality aspect was 5561 or 80%. The following will explain the range of values for aspects of service effectiveness/quality, namely as follows:

**Table 5.30 Range of Service Effectiveness / Quality Values**

Value Range	Category
1390 – 2502	Strongly Disagree
2503 – 3615	Don't agree
3616 – 4728	Disagree
4729 – 5841	Agree
5842 - 6954	Strongly agree

Source: Data Processed Results, 2023

The total value for the effectiveness/quality of service aspect is 5561 or 80% of the maximum percentage for this indicator. From these values it can be concluded that respondents agree that there are aspects of effectiveness/service quality in the closed circuit television (CCTV) based security system in Makassar City.

### **Conclusion**

Based on the research results, electronic government in a closed circuit television (CCTV) based security system in Makassar City shows the following conclusions.

1. Informational disposition includes aspects of access to government information and research results show that the percentage of access to government information is 82.2%. The results show that respondents agree that there is access to government information in the closed circuit television (CCTV) based security system in Makassar City. Therefore, it can be concluded that the closed circuit television (CCTV) based security system in Makassar City

has fulfilled the category of the first quadrant of the e-government initiative framework by Nour et al (2008), namely informational disposition.

2. Transactional disposition includes aspects of democratic responsiveness, integrity, public accountability and transparency. And the research results show that the percentage of the democratic responsiveness aspect is 79%, the integrity aspect is 82.3%, the public accountability aspect is 83.5% and the transparency aspect is 79.3%. Respondents agreed that there is democratic responsiveness, integrity, public accountability and transparency in the closed circuit television (CCTV)-based security system in Makassar City. Therefore, it can be concluded that the closed circuit television (CCTV) based security system in Makassar City has fulfilled the second quadrant category of the e-government initiative framework by Nour et al (2008), namely transactional disposition.

3. Consultation disposition includes aspects of service availability, efficiency/economy, effectiveness/service quality and integrity. The results show that the percentage of service availability aspects is 80.7%, efficiency/economic aspects are 80.9%, service effectiveness/quality aspects are 80% and integrity aspects are 82.3%. And the research results show that respondents agree that there is service availability, efficiency/economy, effectiveness/service quality and integrity in the closed circuit television (CCTV) based security system in Makassar City. Therefore, it can be concluded that the closed circuit television (CCTV) based security system in Makassar City has fulfilled the third quadrant category of the e-government initiative framework by Nour et al (2008), namely consultation disposition.

4. Participatory disposition includes aspects of equity, democratic responsiveness, public accountability, efficiency/economy and effectiveness/quality of service. The research results show that the percentage of equity aspects is 84.7%, democratic responsiveness aspects are 79%, public accountability aspects are 83.5%, efficiency/economic aspects are 80.9% and effectiveness/service quality aspects are 80%. shows that respondents strongly agree that there is equity and agree that there is democratic responsiveness, public accountability, efficiency / economy and effectiveness / quality of service in the closed circuit television (CCTV) based security system in Makassar City. Therefore, it can be concluded that the closed circuit television (CCTV) based security system in Makassar City has fulfilled the fourth quadrant category of the e-government initiative framework by Nour et al (2008), namely participatory disposition.

### **Bibliography**

1. Babbie, E. (2004). *The practice of social research*. Belmont, CA: Wadsworth.
2. Citra, A. (2011). Implementasi E-Government Melalui Bursa Kerja Online Pada Kementerian Tenaga Kerja dan Transmigrasi. Skripsi. Universitas Indonesia.
3. Denhardt, R. B., & Denhardt, J. V. (2003). The new public service: Serving rather than steering. *Public administration review*, 60(6), 549-559.
4. Frederickson, H.G. (1997). *The Spirit of Public Administration*. Jossey-BassPublisher. San Francisco



5. Harakan, A & Ferawaty. (2020). Collaborative Governance Dalam Menjalankan Sistem Keamanan Berbasis Closed Circuit Television (CCTV) Di Kota Makassar. Gorontalo: Journal of Public Administration Studies. Volume 3 Nomor 1.
6. Heriyanto. (2022). Urgensi Penerapan E-Government dalam Pelayanan Publik. Musamus Journal of Public Administration
7. Indrajit, dkk. (2006). Electronic Government: Strategi Pembangunan Dan Pengembangan Sistem Pelayanan Publik Berbasis teknologi Digital. Yogyakarta: Andi
8. Indrajit, R.E. (2002). *Membangun Aplikasi E-Government*. Jakarta: PT Elek Media Komputindo.
9. Indrajit, R.E. (2011). Peranan Teknologi Informasi dan Internet. Yogyakarta: Andi Offset.
10. Kalsum, Ummu. 2019. Public Service Innovation (Case Study of Closed Circuit Television (CCTV) Services in Makassar City). Thesis. Hasanuddin University
11. Keban, Y. T. (2004). Six Strategic Dimensions of Public Administration, Concepts, Theories and Issues. Yogyakarta: Gava Media
12. Lukman, J. P. (2021). Effectiveness of E-Government in Management Systems Village Finance (Siskeudes) in Paconne Village, North Belopa District, Luwu Regency. Thesis. Hasanuddin University
13. Mangkunegara, A.P. (2003). Perencanaan dan Pengembangan Sumber Daya Manusia. Bandung: Refika Aditama
14. Megawati, Lisa. (2020). The Effect of Using E-Government on Employee Discipline at the Tana Toraja Regency Communication and Information Office. Thesis. Muhammadiyah University of Makassar.
15. MR Musa. (2010). An E-Readiness Assessment Tool For Local Authorities: A Pilot Application To Iraq. American University in Cairo
16. Muliawaty, L., & Hendrawan, S. (2020). The Role of E-Gov in Public Services (Case Study: Sumedang Regency Public Service Mall). Policy: Journal of Administrative Sciences, 11 (2), 45-57
17. Mulyadi, D. Hendrik T. Gedeona dan Muhammad Nur Afandi. (2016). Administrasi Publik Untuk Pelayanan Publik. Bandung: Alfabeta.
18. Nour, M. A., AbdelRahman, A. A., & Fadlalla, A. (2007). A context-based integrative framework for e-government initiatives. *Government Information Quarterly*, 25(3), 448-461.
19. Pasolong, H. (2013). *Administrative Research Methods*. Bandung: Alfabeta
20. Rahman, H. (2009). Framework of e-governance at the local government level. In *Proceedings of the 3rd international conference on Theory and practice of electronic governance* (pp. 372-374).
21. Ridwan. (2004). Easy Learning to Research for Teacher-Employees and Beginner Researchers. Bandung: Alfabeta.
22. Sugiyono. (2019). Quantitative, Qualitative and R&D Research Methods. Bandung: Alfabeta.